



Online Learning Evaluation of Islamic Education Using Context, Input, Process, Product Model

Rifadlin Amin¹, Dewi Ratna Bian¹, Nuruh Fathina F. Hamid¹,
Nurasma Ila Ismail¹, Nurfitri Salamah¹, Samlan Ahmad¹,
Abdurahman Hi Usman¹

¹Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ternate, Indonesia

✉ 2502005@student.iain-ternate.ac.id *

Abstract

The digital transformation in higher education has driven a paradigm shift from conventional learning models to the integration of information technology, including Islamic Education courses. This study aims to evaluate the implementation of online learning in Islamic Education at universities by applying Stufflebeam's evaluation model of Context, Input, Process, and Product. A mixed-methods approach was employed, involving lecturers and students as research participants. Data were collected through questionnaires, in-depth interviews, observations, and document analysis. The findings indicate that online learning in Islamic Education is considered effective in terms of context and input, yet faces significant challenges in process and product. Student participation levels are relatively high but remain suboptimal, with major obstacles including technological access gaps, diverse digital competencies among lecturers, and the reduction of affective values in learning. Cognitive learning outcomes were achieved satisfactorily, while affective and psychomotor domains showed declining quality compared to face-to-face learning. The study recommends strengthening lecturers' digital literacy, developing blended learning models, and reformulating evaluation systems capable of measuring competencies holistically. These findings contribute to the development of adaptive and meaningful Islamic Education policies in the digital era.

Article Information:

Received November 10, 2025

Revised December 20, 2025

Accepted January 26, 2026

Keywords: *Online pedagogy, context input process product, blended learning, educational policy*

INTRODUCTION

The rapid advancement of information and communication technology has significantly transformed higher education, making technology-enhanced learning an integral component of educational delivery rather than merely an alternative approach. This transformation accelerated during the COVID-19 pandemic, when universities worldwide, including those in Indonesia, widely adopted online learning to ensure the continuity of academic activities. Although

How to cite:

Amin, R., Bian, D. R., Hamid, N. F. F., Ismail, N. I., Salamah, N., Ahmad, S., & Usman, A. H. (2026). Online Learning Evaluation of Islamic Education Using Context, Input, Process, Product Model. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research of Higher Education (IJMURHICA)*, 9(1), 282-298.

E-ISSN:

2622-741x

Published by:

Islamic Studies and Development Center Universitas Negeri Padang

face-to-face instruction has resumed in most institutions, online and blended learning continue to play an essential role in higher education by offering greater flexibility, accessibility, and efficiency in the teaching and learning process (Rapanta et al., 2020; Teng et al., 2012).

The implementation of online learning provides numerous opportunities to enhance educational quality through digital technologies, broader access to learning resources, and communication that is no longer constrained by time and location (Abubakari et al., 2024; Al-kfairy et al., 2024; Falloon, 2020). However, the effectiveness of online learning depends not only on technological availability but also on institutional readiness, lecturers' competencies, instructional design, course characteristics, and students' engagement throughout the learning process. Previous studies have shown that inadequate digital infrastructure, limited technological literacy, suboptimal instructional strategies, and reduced academic interaction remain major challenges in the implementation of online learning in higher education (Engkizar et al., 2026; Nida et al., 2025; Tobin, 2018).

Within the context of Islamic Religious Education, these challenges become more complex because the course aims not only to develop students' cognitive competencies but also to cultivate religious values, moral character, spiritual awareness, and the ability to practice Islamic teachings in daily life (Engkizar et al., 2026; Haironi & Nicklany, 2024). Unlike courses that primarily emphasize conceptual knowledge, Islamic Religious Education seeks to achieve affective and psychomotor learning outcomes that require meaningful interaction, role modelling, habituation, and experiential learning. The online learning environment may limit these processes of value internalization, highlighting the need for appropriate instructional strategies and comprehensive evaluation frameworks capable of assessing learning outcomes holistically.

The challenges associated with online Islamic Religious Education learning extend beyond technological readiness to include lecturers' pedagogical competence in designing interactive learning experiences, students' readiness for self-directed learning, and the integration of Islamic values and digital ethics throughout the instructional process (Abu et al., 2022; Lee et al., 2014; Prayogi & Prihatin, 2024). These interconnected challenges indicate that the effectiveness of online learning should not be evaluated solely based on academic achievement but should also consider the quality of instructional implementation and the extent to which the broader objectives of Islamic education are achieved.

Based on these considerations, this study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of online learning in Islamic Religious Education courses using the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) evaluation model (Agus et al., 2023; Mubai et al., 2021; Muzakki & Mustofa, 2022). Specifically, the study seeks to examine the context, input, process, and product dimensions of online learning, analyze students' participation and learning achievement, identify the challenges encountered during implementation, and formulate strategies for improving the quality of online Islamic Religious Education instruction in higher education (Setiawan et al., 2021).

To accomplish these objectives, this study employs the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model developed by Daniel Stufflebeam (Junining & Prawoto, 2020; Wajdi et al., 2020). The CIPP model was selected because it is one of the most comprehensive and systematic evaluation frameworks in educational research, enabling program evaluation from needs assessment and resource preparation to implementation and outcome

evaluation. The four interrelated components of the CIPP model provide a holistic understanding of program effectiveness by examining contextual conditions, available resources, implementation processes, and learning outcomes. A summary of the CIPP evaluation model is presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Components of the CIPP Evaluation Model
(Stufflebeam, 1971)

Component	Evaluation Focus	Key Questions	Component
Context	Background, needs, objectives, and program environment	What are the intended objectives? Do they address actual needs? What external challenges may influence program implementation?	Context
Input	Available resources, including lecturers, facilities, budget, curriculum, and instructional strategies	What resources are available to achieve the program objectives?	Input
Process	Program implementation, quality of execution, identification of strengths, weaknesses, and feedback	How is the program implemented? What challenges arise during implementation? What improvements are needed?	Process
Product	Program outcomes, achievement of objectives, and short- and long-term impacts	To what extent have the program objectives been achieved? What impacts have been generated?	Product

Although the CIPP model has been widely applied to evaluate educational programs and online learning across various disciplines, its application to the evaluation of online Islamic Religious Education courses in higher education remains limited (Junining & Prawoto, 2020; Nugraha & Kusumawardhani, 2022; Syahrir, 2022). Previous studies have primarily focused on the technical aspects of technology use, user satisfaction, the effectiveness of digital learning platforms, or students' cognitive achievement. In contrast, comprehensive evaluations integrating the context, input, process, and product dimensions to assess cognitive, affective, and psychomotor learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education have received comparatively little attention. This gap highlights the need for a comprehensive evaluation framework capable of capturing the unique characteristics of online Islamic Religious Education in the digital era.

The novelty of this study lies in the comprehensive application of the CIPP evaluation model by integrating all four of its components with a mixed methods sequential explanatory approach to evaluate online Islamic Religious Education holistically (Izzah et al., 2024; Wajdi et al., 2020). Unlike previous studies that employed only selected CIPP dimensions or concentrated primarily on the technical aspects of online learning, this study simultaneously examines students' cognitive, affective, and psychomotor learning outcomes within a single systematic evaluation framework. Theoretically, this research extends the application of the CIPP model to educational contexts emphasizing character formation, religious values, and spirituality. Practically, the findings are expected to provide evidence-based recommendations for policymakers, university administrators, and lecturers in designing more

effective, holistic, and sustainable online Islamic Religious Education courses.

METHODS

This study employed a mixed methods approach using a sequential explanatory design, in which quantitative data collection and analysis were conducted first, followed by qualitative inquiry to explain and deepen the quantitative findings (Gierus et al., 2025; Salajegheh et al., 2024; Snelson, 2016). This approach was selected to provide a comprehensive evaluation of online Islamic Religious Education by integrating numerical evidence with participants' experiences and perspectives.

The study adopted an evaluative research design based on the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) evaluation model developed by Stufflebeam. The CIPP model served as the evaluation framework for assessing the effectiveness of online Islamic Religious Education learning by examining the learning context, the adequacy of available resources, the implementation of instructional activities, and the learning outcomes achieved.

The study involved 48 undergraduate students and 12 lecturers teaching Islamic Religious Education courses from three higher education institutions, consisting of two Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Negeri and one private university. Participants were selected using purposive sampling based on the criterion that they had participated in or taught online Islamic Religious Education courses for at least one academic semester. In addition to the primary data obtained from participants, secondary data were collected from instructional documents, including semester lesson plans, recordings of synchronous learning sessions, and students' assessment records (Adl-Amini et al., 2024; Engkizar et al., 2025; Engkizar et al., 2026; Jima'ain et al., 2024).

Data were collected using multiple instruments. A structured questionnaire employing a five-point Likert scale was administered to measure students' and lecturers' perceptions across the four CIPP dimensions (Rokeman, 2024). Semi-structured interview guidelines were used to explore participants' experiences and perspectives in greater depth, while observation sheets were employed to examine the implementation of synchronous online learning throughout one academic semester. Document analysis guidelines were also used to review relevant instructional documents. The questionnaire was validated through expert judgment and a pilot test, while its internal consistency was assessed using Cronbach's alpha coefficient (Bujang et al., 2018; Edelsbrunner et al., 2025; Hussey et al., 2025).

Quantitative data were analyzed using descriptive statistics, including frequencies, percentages, means, and standard deviations, to describe the evaluation results for each CIPP dimension. Correlation analysis was subsequently conducted to identify factors associated with students' participation in online learning. Qualitative data obtained from interviews, observations, and document analysis were analyzed using thematic analysis, following the stages of data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing (Alouzi et al., 2026; Hasan et al., 2025). To enhance the trustworthiness of the findings, source and method triangulation were employed by comparing evidence obtained from questionnaires, interviews, observations, and documentary data across each component of the CIPP evaluation model.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Context Evaluation

The context evaluation examined the objectives of Islamic Religious Education, students' learning needs, and the alignment of the curriculum with

the demands of the digital era. Questionnaire findings indicated that 87.5% of students considered online Islamic Religious Education learning important for improving access to Islamic learning materials, while 82.3% agreed that online learning provided greater flexibility in terms of time and place. These findings suggest that students generally perceive online learning as an effective medium for increasing learning accessibility.

However, the interview data revealed a discrepancy between the intended objectives of the curriculum and its implementation in practice. One lecturer explained:

...Curricularly, Islamic Religious Education aims to develop students' character and spirituality. However, in an online learning environment, these aspects are much more difficult to teach and assess. Most of our efforts are directed toward transferring knowledge rather than fostering attitudes and character. (informant)

This finding indicates that although online learning successfully supports cognitive learning outcomes, it remains less effective in facilitating the development of affective and psychomotor competencies, which constitute the primary objectives of Islamic Religious Education. These results are consistent with the findings of [Qoyimah & Ratnasari \(2025\)](#), who argued that Islamic Religious Education in higher education is frequently reduced to a compulsory academic requirement with limited integration into students' disciplinary knowledge and professional contexts. Furthermore, the rapid transition to digital learning following the COVID-19 pandemic has transformed higher education substantially, whereas the Islamic Religious Education curriculum has not yet fully adapted to instructional approaches capable of achieving affective learning outcomes in digital environments ([Sukiman et al., 2022](#); [Tohirin & Mardiana, 2025](#)).

Regarding students' learning needs, 79.2% of respondents expressed the need for Islamic Religious Education that is contextual and closely connected to everyday life. Students expected learning materials that could be applied in their academic, professional, and social environments rather than merely emphasizing normative religious knowledge. These findings underscore the importance of redesigning the Islamic Religious Education curriculum to better respond to contemporary societal demands and the characteristics of digitally connected learners.

The context evaluation also identified external challenges associated with the widespread availability of religious content on digital and social media platforms. A total of 68.8% of respondents acknowledged that they regularly accessed religious information from online sources outside formal classroom activities. While this phenomenon expands learning opportunities, it also increases the risk of students encountering inaccurate or unverified religious information. Consequently, lecturers are expected to play a more active role in strengthening students' digital religious literacy by guiding them in critically evaluating online sources and promoting the use of credible, evidence-based Islamic references ([Kasheem et al., 2025](#); [Kassymova et al., 2025](#); [Rambe et al., 2025](#)).

Input Evaluation

The input evaluation examined the readiness of resources supporting the implementation of online Islamic Religious Education, including lecturers' digital competence, technological infrastructure, learning materials, and

instructional strategies.

Lecturers' Digital Competence

Questionnaire findings indicated that 62.5% of lecturers perceived themselves as having adequate digital competence to deliver online Islamic Religious Education courses. However, classroom observations revealed that only 41.7% effectively utilized the features of the Learning Management System to facilitate meaningful learning interactions. This discrepancy suggests that lecturers' self-perceived competence does not necessarily correspond to their actual instructional practices.

Interview findings further revealed that the primary barriers to improving digital competence were limited professional development opportunities and insufficient pedagogically oriented training. One lecturer explained:

...I can use Zoom and Google Classroom to deliver course materials. However, I am still not accustomed to developing interactive content such as animated videos, digital quizzes, or discussion forums that encourage critical thinking. Most of the training provided focuses on technical operation rather than digital pedagogy. (informant)

These findings indicate that technological proficiency alone is insufficient to ensure effective online instruction. Lecturers also require competencies in designing engaging, student-centered digital learning experiences that promote active participation. This result is consistent with the findings of [Mintasih et al \(2024\)](#), who reported that most Islamic Religious Education teachers continue to rely primarily on basic presentation media and have not yet optimized digital technologies to support innovative learning. Similarly, previous research conducted at STAI Sumatra Medan identified lecturers' difficulties in implementing instructional procedures and facilitating the effective application of online learning strategies.

Technological Infrastructure

The evaluation also identified considerable disparities in technological infrastructure across participating institutions. At the two Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Negeri, 85.4% of students reported having stable internet access with adequate connection speed, whereas only 62.3% of students from the private university experienced similar conditions. These differences were primarily associated with geographical location and socioeconomic factors, both of which continue to influence students' access to digital learning. The most frequently reported technological challenges experienced by students are presented in Table 2.

Table 2. Technological infrastructure challenges experienced by students

Challenge	Percentage of Students
Limited internet data packages	54.2%
Unstable internet connectivity in certain regions	47.9%
Limited access to laptops or computers	33.3%
Power outages in several areas	20.8%

The findings demonstrate that unequal access to digital infrastructure remains one of the major barriers to effective online learning. Students who experienced unstable internet connections or lacked adequate digital devices encountered greater difficulties in participating in synchronous learning activities and accessing online instructional resources. These findings support previous studies identifying the digital divide as one of the most significant obstacles to

the successful implementation of online learning in Indonesia (Taridi et al., 2024).

Learning Materials

The input evaluation also examined the availability and quality of digital learning materials used in online Islamic Religious Education courses. The questionnaire results showed that 75.0% of lecturers had developed digital learning materials to support online instruction. However, the quality and level of innovation varied considerably. Approximately 58.3% of lecturers relied primarily on presentation slides and Portable Document Format files as their main instructional resources, while only 16.7% had developed interactive multimedia materials. Furthermore, merely 8.3% incorporated animated videos or digital simulations to facilitate students' understanding of abstract concepts in Islamic teachings.

Interview findings indicated that lecturers recognized the importance of developing engaging digital learning materials but faced several practical constraints. One lecturer stated:

...We understand that students need more interactive learning materials. However, developing multimedia content requires considerable time, technical skills, and institutional support. As a result, many lecturers still rely on presentation slides and reading materials because they are more practical to prepare. (informant)

These findings suggest that the availability of digital learning materials has improved; however, their instructional quality remains uneven. This result is consistent with previous research conducted at Universitas Khairun, which demonstrated that digitally based Islamic Religious Education teaching materials that are valid, practical, and effective can significantly improve students' learning outcomes (Muhamad et al., 2023). Nevertheless, producing high-quality digital content requires sufficient technological competence, institutional support, and adequate time for instructional development.

Instructional Strategies

The evaluation further examined the instructional strategies adopted by lecturers in delivering online Islamic Religious Education courses. The findings revealed that lecturers predominantly employed teacher-centered approaches, particularly synchronous lectures delivered through video conferencing and individual assignments. More student-centered approaches, such as project-based learning and case-based discussions, were implemented less frequently.

Table 3. Online instructional strategies used in Islamic religious education courses

Instructional Strategy	Percentage of Use
Lectures delivered through video conferencing	91.7%
Individual assignments	87.5%
Online discussion forums	75.0%
Online quizzes and formative assessment	70.8%
Project-based learning	37.5%
Case studies and analysis of contemporary issues	33.3%

Interview data further indicated that lecturers tended to prioritize instructional strategies that were easier to implement within online learning environments. As one lecturer explained:

...Video conferencing and assignments are the most practical approaches because they are familiar to both lecturers and students. Project-based learning and case discussions

require more preparation, closer supervision, and continuous interaction, which are often difficult to maintain in online classes. (informant)

These findings indicate that although lecturers have adopted a variety of online instructional strategies, learning activities continue to be dominated by conventional approaches centered on content delivery. This finding is consistent with previous research conducted in the Islamic Religious Education Study Program at STAI Sumatra Medan, which reported the implementation of assignment-based learning, project-based activities, literacy tasks, and online discussions. However, research conducted at Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Yogyakarta demonstrated that instructional strategies integrating a Learning Management System, animated learning videos, and interactive online quizzes were more effective in promoting student engagement, with participation levels reaching 78%. These findings suggest that the integration of interactive digital technologies with student-centered pedagogical approaches has greater potential to enhance the effectiveness of online Islamic Religious Education learning.

Process Evaluation

The process evaluation focused on the implementation of online Islamic Religious Education, the quality of lecturer–student interaction, students’ participation, and the operational challenges encountered throughout the learning process.

Implementation of Online Learning

Classroom observations conducted over one academic semester revealed considerable variation in the implementation of online learning. On average, synchronous learning sessions lasted between 60 and 90 minutes per week, with approximately 70% of the allocated time devoted to content delivery and the remaining 30% to discussion and question-and-answer activities. Although this structure ensured that course content was delivered effectively, it provided relatively limited opportunities for collaborative learning, reflective dialogue, and active student engagement. Previous studies have emphasized that Islamic Religious Education in the digital era requires more interactive and contextual instructional approaches to address existing pedagogical challenges and enhance meaningful learning experiences.

The quality of interaction during online learning emerged as one of the principal concerns. Classroom observations indicated that 58.3% of lecturers dominated classroom communication during synchronous sessions, whereas students generally assumed passive roles. This pattern suggests that online Islamic Religious Education continues to rely predominantly on a teacher-centered approach characterized by one-way knowledge transmission, which may limit opportunities for developing critical thinking, collaborative learning, and the internalization of Islamic values.

Interview findings further confirmed this tendency. One lecturer stated:
...During online classes, students tend to remain silent unless they are directly asked to respond. Consequently, I often spend most of the session explaining the material because classroom discussions do not develop as actively as they do in face-to-face learning. (informant)

These findings indicate that the effectiveness of online learning is influenced not only by technological infrastructure but also by the quality of pedagogical interaction established between lecturers and students. This finding is consistent with [Taridi et al \(2024\)](#), who reported that the success of online

learning depends largely on meaningful interaction supported by well-designed pedagogical strategies.

Student Participation

Student participation in online Islamic Religious Education was generally satisfactory. Approximately 78.3% of students attended synchronous learning sessions regularly, while 72.9% submitted their assignments on time. Nevertheless, participation in asynchronous discussion forums remained relatively limited, with only 45.8% of students actively contributing comments, questions, or responses during online discussions. These findings suggest that although students fulfilled the basic requirements of course participation, their engagement in collaborative learning and critical reflection remained relatively low.

The correlation analysis identified several factors associated with students' participation in online learning, as presented in Table 4.

Table 4. Factors influencing student participation in online Islamic religious education

Factor	Correlation Coefficient (<i>r</i>)	Significance (<i>p</i>)
Relevance of learning materials to everyday life	0.62	<i>p</i> < 0.01
Lecturers' communication skills	0.58	<i>p</i> < 0.01
Availability of stable internet access	0.45	<i>p</i> < 0.05
Motivating assessment methods	0.41	<i>p</i> < 0.05

Interview data also highlighted that students were more motivated to participate when learning activities were directly connected to authentic social and religious issues. One student commented:

...I am more motivated to participate when the discussion is related to real issues that we encounter in everyday life rather than simply reviewing theoretical concepts from the textbook. (informant)

These findings suggest that the relevance of learning content and the quality of lecturers' communication are stronger determinants of student participation than technological factors alone. This conclusion is consistent with research conducted at Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Yogyakarta, which demonstrated that integrating digital technologies into instructional design significantly enhanced student engagement. However, the present findings also indicate that increasing participation rates alone is insufficient. Effective online Islamic Religious Education should also promote meaningful discussion, critical reflection, and active engagement to achieve its intended cognitive, affective, and psychomotor learning outcomes.

Operational Challenges

The qualitative findings identified several operational challenges that influenced the effectiveness of online Islamic Religious Education. The first challenge was the unequal availability of technological infrastructure. Differences in students' geographical locations resulted in unequal internet connectivity, particularly for those living in rural areas and Indonesia's frontier, outermost, and disadvantaged regions. These disparities affected students' ability to participate consistently in synchronous learning activities and access digital learning resources.

The second challenge concerned the limited development of affective

learning outcomes, which represent one of the primary objectives of Islamic Religious Education. Although online learning effectively facilitated the delivery of theoretical knowledge, it was less successful in promoting character formation, spiritual development, and the internalization of Islamic values. One student explained:

...In online classes, I can learn about Islamic morals and ethics theoretically. However, experiencing and practicing those values is very different from participating in warm face-to-face discussions or receiving direct advice from the lecturer. There is a sense of depth that is missing. (informant)

This finding suggests that online learning environments provide fewer opportunities for meaningful interpersonal interaction and experiential learning, both of which are essential for achieving the affective objectives of Islamic Religious Education.

Additional challenges were also identified through interviews and observations. Limited face-to-face interaction among students reduced opportunities for collaborative learning and the development of communication and interpersonal skills. Both lecturers and students also reported experiencing increased administrative demands because they were required to manage multiple digital platforms, assignments, and online assessment systems simultaneously. Furthermore, lecturers encountered difficulties in conducting authentic assessments, particularly when evaluating students' practical worship skills and religious attitudes through online learning environments. Another significant challenge involved the limited availability of professional development related to digital pedagogy. Not all lecturers possessed sufficient technological and instructional media competencies to implement hybrid learning effectively, which consequently affected the quality of instructional design, learning activities, and course delivery.

Overall, these findings indicate that the effectiveness of online Islamic Religious Education is shaped not only by technological readiness but also by pedagogical, social, and institutional factors. Addressing these interconnected challenges requires comprehensive institutional support through equitable digital infrastructure, continuous professional development for lecturers, and instructional strategies that strengthen interaction, authentic assessment, and the cultivation of affective and spiritual competencies in digital learning environments.

Product Evaluation

The product evaluation assessed the learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education across the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains.

Cognitive Learning Outcomes

The final semester assessment indicated that students achieved an average score of 79.6 on a 100-point scale. The grade distribution consisted of 12.5% receiving grade A, 45.8% grade B, 33.3% grade C, 6.3% grade D, and 2.1% grade E. Compared with the average score obtained during previous face-to-face learning (75.2), these findings suggest an improvement in students' cognitive achievement following the implementation of online learning.

Table 5. Distribution of final semester grades in the cognitive domain

Grade Category	Percentage of Students
A	12.5%
B	45.8%
C	33.3%

D	6.3%
E	2.1%
Average Score (Online Learning)	79.6
Average Score (Face-to-Face Learning)	75.2

The improvement in cognitive performance may be attributed to several factors. Online learning enabled students to revisit instructional materials repeatedly, provided greater flexibility in managing their study schedules, and expanded access to a wide range of digital learning resources. These conditions likely supported students in achieving better academic performance than during conventional classroom instruction (Suppipat & Hu, 2022).

Nevertheless, the increase in cognitive achievement should be interpreted with caution. Higher examination scores do not necessarily indicate deeper conceptual understanding, as online assessment environments provide students with easier access to external information and may increase the risk of academic dishonesty. One lecturer expressed this concern as follows:

...Students' grades are indeed higher, but I am not entirely convinced that these scores truly reflect their understanding. During online examinations, it is difficult to ensure that students complete the assessments independently without consulting external sources. (informant)

This finding suggests that cognitive achievement measured through online assessments should be interpreted alongside the quality of assessment design and academic integrity mechanisms. These results are consistent with the findings of Adiyono et al (2025), who reported that the Learning Management System can promote independent learning and strengthen accountability through the Islamic principles of *amanah* (trustworthiness) and *adl* (justice). At the same time, their study highlighted persistent concerns regarding the credibility and integrity of digital assessment systems. Therefore, improving cognitive learning outcomes should be accompanied by the development of authentic assessment strategies capable of measuring students' understanding while minimizing opportunities for academic misconduct.

Affective Learning Outcomes

In contrast to the cognitive domain, learning outcomes in the affective domain showed a noticeable decline during the implementation of online Islamic Religious Education. Based on lecturers' assessments of students' religious attitudes, the average affective score decreased from 87.5 during face-to-face instruction to 79.2 during online learning on a 100-point scale. This decline indicates that online learning was less effective in fostering the values, attitudes, and spiritual development that constitute the core objectives of Islamic Religious Education.

Table 6. Indicators of declining affective learning outcomes during online learning

Indicator	Decline
Attendance and punctuality in synchronous learning sessions	12.5%
Active participation in discussions of Islamic values	18.7%
Consistency in practicing Islamic values in daily life	15.4%
Spiritual awareness in everyday life	10.8%
Religious attitude score (face-to-face: 87.5; online: 79.2)	8.3 points

Interview findings supported the quantitative results by illustrating the challenges of cultivating students' character and spirituality through online learning. One lecturer explained:

...Delivering religious knowledge online is relatively manageable. However, nurturing students' character, attitudes, and spirituality requires continuous interaction, personal guidance, and direct role modelling, which are difficult to achieve in virtual classrooms. (informant)

These findings suggest that while online learning facilitates knowledge acquisition, it provides fewer opportunities for the internalization of Islamic values and the development of students' affective competencies. This result is consistent with previous studies emphasizing that Islamic Religious Education in higher education plays a fundamental role in character formation and spiritual development, objectives that remain difficult to achieve through fully online learning environments.

Psychomotor Learning Outcomes

The psychomotor domain, which encompasses students' religious practices and the application of Islamic values in daily life, also demonstrated lower achievement during online learning. Only 45.8% of students were assessed by lecturers as consistently practicing Islamic teachings in their daily lives, compared with 64.6% during face-to-face instruction.

Interview findings revealed that lecturers experienced considerable difficulty in assessing practical religious competencies through online learning. One lecturer stated:

...It is difficult to evaluate students' practical worship skills through online learning. We cannot directly observe how they perform their prayers, practice religious rituals, or demonstrate Islamic values in their daily interactions. (informant)

These findings indicate that online learning environments provide limited opportunities for authentic observation of students' religious practices and behavioral development. Consequently, the assessment of psychomotor competencies remains one of the greatest challenges in evaluating online Islamic Religious Education.

Synthesis of Findings

Overall, the findings from the four components of the Context, Input, Process, and Product evaluation model provide comprehensive answers to the research objectives. The context and input evaluations indicate that online Islamic Religious Education is relevant to students' learning needs and supported by relatively adequate institutional resources, suggesting that the fundamental conditions for implementation have largely been established. However, the process and product evaluations reveal a different pattern. Although student participation was generally satisfactory and cognitive achievement improved, these positive outcomes were not accompanied by comparable improvements in affective and psychomotor learning outcomes.

This pattern reflects a structural gap between institutional readiness and the overall effectiveness of online learning implementation. The findings suggest that this gap is primarily associated with the predominance of teacher-centered instructional approaches and the limited pedagogical competence required to design meaningful digital learning experiences (Matsuyama et al., 2019; Qamar et al., 2024). Consequently, improving the quality of online Islamic Religious Education requires more than technological investment alone. It also necessitates strengthening lecturers' digital pedagogical competencies, expanding the implementation of blended learning, and developing authentic assessment systems capable of evaluating cognitive, affective, and psychomotor

competencies in an integrated and holistic manner.

CONCLUSION

This study demonstrates that online Islamic Religious Education courses in higher education are supported by adequate contextual conditions and institutional resources. However, they have not yet achieved balanced learning outcomes across the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. While students' cognitive achievement improved, affective and psychomotor learning outcomes declined compared with face-to-face instruction. These disparities are primarily associated with the predominance of teacher-centered knowledge transmission, unequal access to digital technology, and lecturers limited digital pedagogical competencies. The findings indicate that online Islamic Religious Education has not yet fully fulfilled its fundamental role in fostering students' character formation and spiritual development. Therefore, improving the quality of online Islamic Religious Education requires strengthening lecturers' digital literacy and pedagogical competencies, expanding the implementation of blended learning that effectively integrates synchronous and asynchronous learning activities, and reformulating assessment systems capable of evaluating cognitive, affective, and psychomotor competencies in a comprehensive and holistic manner. These findings further imply that higher education institutions and policymakers responsible for Islamic Religious Education should develop online learning policies that extend beyond the efficient delivery of knowledge to emphasize the cultivation of students' religious values, character, and religious practices within digital learning environments.

REFERENCES

- Abu, S. H. N., Saraha, A. R., & Ibrahim, F. (2022). SDBL-Prodeo (Self-Directed Belended Learning-oriented Prodeo) Design and Validation to Improve Digital Literacy Chemistry Teacher Candidate Students. *EduLine: Journal of Education and Learning Innovation*, 2(4), 406–414. <https://doi.org/10.35877/454RI.eduline1203>
- Abubakari, M. S., Zakaria, G. A. N., & Musa, J. (2024). Perceived compatibility and students' intention to adopt digital technologies in Islamic education institutions. *Cogent Education*, 11(1), 2430869. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2024.2430869>
- Adiyono, A., Fitri, A. Z., & Sanam, A. I. (2025). LMS-Based Assessment and Islamic Pedagogy: A Qualitative Case Study in an Indonesian Private University. *Journal of Educational Research and Practice*, 3(3), 509. <https://doi.org/10.70376/jerp.v3i3.414>
- Adl-Amini, K., Völlinger, V. A., & Eckart, A. (2024). Implementation quality of cooperative learning and teacher beliefs—a mixed methods study. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, 39(3), 2267–2281. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10212-023-00769-3>
- Agus, A., Juliadharma, M., & Djamaluddin, M. (2023). Application of the CIPP Model in Evaluation of The Inclusive Education Curriculum in Madrasah Aliyah. *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 8(1), 31–50. <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v8i1.2705>
- Al-kfairy, M., Mustafa, D., Kshetri, N., Insiew, M., & Alfandi, O. (2024). Ethical Challenges and Solutions of Generative AI: An Interdisciplinary Perspective. *Informatics*, 11(3), 58. <https://doi.org/10.3390/informatics11030058>
- Alouzi, K., Atia, A., Omran, S., Alrumayh, S., Albshkar, H., Alatrish, E.,

- Masuwd, M., & Alfallah, B. (2026). AI and Cultural Sensitivity: Student Perceptions of How AI Handles Religion, Identity, and Tradition in Texts. *Muaddib: Journal of Islamic Teaching and Learning*, 2(1), 1–21.
- Bujang, M. A., Omar, E. D., & Baharum, N. A. (2018). A review on sample size determination for cronbach's alpha test: A simple guide for researchers. *Malaysian Journal of Medical Sciences*, 25(6), 85–99. <https://doi.org/10.21315/mjms2018.25.6.9>
- Edelsbrunner, P. A., Simonsmeier, B. A., & Schneider, M. (2025). The Cronbach's Alpha of Domain-Specific Knowledge Tests Before and After Learning: A Meta-Analysis of Published Studies. *Educational Psychology Review*, 37(1), 4. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-024-09982-y>
- Engkizar, E., Jaafar, A., Hamzah, M. I., Langputeh, S., Rahman, I., & Febriani, A. (2025). Analysis Problems of Quranic Education Teachers in Indonesia: Systematic Literature Review. *International Journal of Islamic Studies Higher Education*, 4(2), 92–108. <https://insight.ppi.unp.ac.id/index.php/insight>
- Engkizar, E., Jaafar, A., Hamzah, M. I., Syafril, S., Ediz, M. H., Efendi, E., Ridha, A., Febriani, A., & Oktavia, G. (2026). Tartil Method as an Effective Pedagogical Approach for Enhancing Students' Interest in Quranic Learning. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research of Higher Education (IJMURHICA)*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24036/ijmurhica.v9i1.637>
- Engkizar, E., Jaafar, A., Hamzah, M. I., Syafril, S., Febriani, A., Oktavia, G., & Satrial, A. (2026). Quran Teachers' Skills as Pedagogical Foundations: Conceptual and Practical Insights into Nine Competencies. *Muaddib: Journal of Islamic Teaching and Learning*, 2(1), 22–38.
- Falloon, G. (2020). From digital literacy to digital competence: the teacher digital competency (TDC) framework. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 68(5), 2449–2472. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-020-09767-4>
- Gierus, B., Du, T., Maduforo, A. N., Gilbert, B., & Koh, K. (2025). Prevalence and Quality of Mixed Methods Research in Educational Subdisciplines: A Systematic Review. *SAGE Open*, 15(2), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440251335171>
- Haironi, A., & Nicklany, D. (2024). Nilai-Nilai Perjuangan KH.Ahmad Dahlan yang Ditanamkan Kepada Muridnya. *Jurnal Budi Pekerti Agama Islam*, 2(6), 08–14. <https://doi.org/10.61132/jbpai.v1i6.582>
- Hasan, F., Tomikal, T., & Gilling, M. (2025). Six Academic Attitudes of Muslim Scholars Toward Knowledge Sources in the Digital Era. *Muaddib: Journal of Islamic Teaching and Learning*, 1(3), 109–122.
- Hussey, I., Alsalti, T., Bosco, F., Elson, M., & Arslan, R. (2025). An Aberrant Abundance of Cronbach's Alpha Values at .70. *Advances in Methods and Practices in Psychological Science*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.1177/25152459241287123>
- Izzah, N., Halimah, S., & Haidir, H. (2024). Evaluation of the Implementation of the Tahfiz Al-Quran 30 Juz Program (Context, Inputs, Processes, and Products) at the Islamic Centre North Sumatra. *Scaffolding: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Dan Multikulturalisme*, 6(2), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.37680/scaffolding.v6i2.5556>
- Jima'ain, M. T. A., Mohamed, A. M., Hehsan, A., Saidalvi, A., Nasi, B. M., Faisal, M. S., & Awae, F. (2024). Embedding higher order thinking skills in Islamic history (Sirah) education in Malaysia. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*, 13(2), 952–959.

<https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v13i2.26431>

- Junining, E., & Prawoto, S. (2020). Evaluasi Model Program Kelas Internasional Di Perguruan Tinggi Dalam Perspektif Kelembagaan. *Jurnal Hasta Wiyata*, 3(2), 114–119. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.hastawiyata.2020.003.02.06>
- Kasheem, M., Yahya, N., Shalghoum, N., Masuwd, M., Alriteemi, A., Abdullah, M., Alsaeh, F., & Alrumayh, S. (2025). Artificial Intelligence in Academic Research: Adoption, Opportunities, and Barriers among Faculty in Libya Higher Education. *Multidisciplinary Journal of Thought and Research*, 1(3), 109–127. <https://doi.org/10.67055/hz4b7314>
- Kassymova, G. K., Talgatov, Y. K., Arpentieva, M. R., Abishev, A. R., & Menshikov, P. V. (2025). Artificial Intelligence in the Development of the Theory and Practices of Self-Directed Learning. *Multidisciplinary Journal of Thought and Research*, 1(3), 66–79. <https://mujoter.intischolar.id/index.php/mujoter/article/view/19>
- Lee, K. S., Tsai, P. S., Chai, C. S., & Koh, J. H. L. (2014). Students' perceptions of self-directed learning and collaborative learning with and without technology. *Journal of Computer Assisted Learning*, 30(5), 425–437. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jcal.12055>
- Matsuyama, Y., Nakaya, M., Okazaki, H., Lebowitz, A. J., Leppink, J., & van der Vleuten, C. (2019). Does changing from a teacher-centered to a learner-centered context promote self-regulated learning: a qualitative study in a Japanese undergraduate setting. *BMC Medical Education*, 19(1), 152. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-019-1550-x>
- Mintasih, D., Sukiman, S., & Purnama, S. (2024). Integration of Digital Technology in Islamic Religious Education Learning: A Qualitative Study on Teachers' Competence and Implementation Models in Secondary Schools. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 13(1), 85–96. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpi.2024.131.85-96>
- Mubai, A., Jalinus, N., Ambiyar, A., Wakhinuddin, W., Abdullah, R., Rizal, F., & Waskito, W. (2021). Implementasi Model Cipp Dalam Evaluasi Kurikulum Pendidikan Teknik Informatika. *Edukatif: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 3(4), 1383–1394. <https://doi.org/10.31004/edukatif.v3i4.549>
- Muhamad, S., Jamil, M., Sergi, M., & Purnomo, E. (2023). Pengembangan Virtual Learning Managament System (Vilonga) Dalam Pembelajaran Daring Mahasiswa Pendidikan Profesi Guru di Lingkungan Universitas Khairun. *Jurnal Teknologi Informasi*, 9(2), 132–139. <https://doi.org/10.52643/jti.v9i2.3511>
- Muzakki, F. R., & Mustofa, T. A. (2022). Evaluasi Model CIPP Dalam Pembelajaran Tahfidz al-Quran Di Pendidikan Ulama Tarjih Muhammadiyah (PUTM). *Iseedu: Journal of Islamic Educational Thoughts and Practices*, 6(2), 146–163. <https://doi.org/10.23917/iseedu.v6i2.22118>
- Nida, S., Murdianto, Setiyawan, A., Sihono, & Zefrizen, A. (2025). Realize digital transformation in higher education. *ATTARBIYAH: Journal of Islamic Culture and Education*, 10(2), 141–154. <https://doi.org/10.18326/attarbiyah.v10i2.141-154>
- Nugraha, B. S. P., & Kusumawardhani, D. (2022). Model Pengendalian Kegiatan Corporate Social Responsibility (Csr) Berkelanjutan Dalam Pembentukan Karakter Socioprenuer. *Jurnal Economina*, 1(3), 608–619. <https://doi.org/10.55681/economina.v1i3.150>
- Prayogi, M. D., & Prihatin, T. (2024). Improving Students' self-directed learning through visual novel games: its effectiveness and potential.

- Indonesian Journal of Curriculum and Educational Technology Studies*, 12(1), 45–56. <https://doi.org/10.15294/ijcets.v12i1.15307>
- Qamar, M. T., Malik, A., Yasmeen, J., Sadiqe, M., & Ajmal, M. (2024). Incorporating face-to-face and online learning features to propose blended learning framework for Post-COVID classrooms in India. *Asian Association of Open Universities Journal*, 19(1), 70–87. <https://doi.org/10.1108/AAOUJ-08-2023-0097>
- Qoyimah, D., & Ratnasari, D. (2025). Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Sekolah dan Perguruan Tinggi Umum: Kajian Kurikulum, Metode, dan Problematika Pembelajaran di Era Digital Universitas Negeri Islam Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta 12. *Indonesian Journal of Action Research (IJAR)*, 4(2), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ijar.2025.42-01>
- Rambe, F. S. P., Mawardi, M., Saengngern, A., Suryani, O., & Akmar, R. (2025). Discord-Enhanced Flipped Guided Inquiry Learning: A Modern Approach to Teaching Chemical Bonding to Improve Student Motivation. *Multidisciplinary Journal of Thought and Research*, 1(3), 128–136. <https://doi.org/10.67055/xsp83r33>
- Rapanta, C., Botturi, L., Goodyear, P., Guàrdia, L., & Koole, M. (2020). Online University Teaching During and After the Covid-19 Crisis: Refocusing Teacher Presence and Learning Activity. *Postdigital Science and Education*, 2(3), 923–945. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s42438-020-00155-y>
- Rokeman, N. R. M. (2024). Likert Measurement Scale in Education and Social Sciences: Explored and Explained. *EDUCATUM Journal of Social Sciences*, 10(10), 77–88. <https://doi.org/10.37134/ejoss.vol10.1.7.2024>
- Salajegheh, M., Sandars, J., Mirzazadeh, A., & Gandomkar, R. (2024). Understanding the capacity development of faculty development programs: a sequential explanatory mixed methods study. *BMC Medical Education*, 24(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05715-5>
- Setiawan, R., Aman, A., Prasajo, L. D., & Mehta, K. (2021). Evaluation of hybrid learning in college using CIPP model. *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Evaluasi Pendidikan*, 25(2). <https://doi.org/10.21831/pep.v25i2.46348>
- Snelson, C. L. (2016). Qualitative and mixed methods social media research: A review of the literature. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 15(1). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406915624574>
- Sukiman, Haningsih, S., & Rohmi, P. (2022). The pattern of hybrid learning to maintain learning effectiveness at the higher education level post-COVID-19 pandemic. *European Journal of Educational Research*, 11(1), 243–257. <https://doi.org/10.12973/eu-jer.11.1.243>
- Suppipat, S., & Hu, A. H. (2022). A scoping review of design for circularity in the electrical and electronics industry. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling Advances*, 13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rcradv.2022.200064>
- Syahrir, S. (2022). Evaluasi Kurikulum Belajar Mandiri TK Menggunakan Model CIPP Stufflebeam. *Jurnal Ilmiah Mandala Education*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.58258/jime.v8i1.2779>
- Taridi, M., Risnita, Yaakob, M. F. M., & Khairani, M. (2024). An evaluative study for communicative language teaching (CLT) on online teaching and learning in higher education: Indonesian and Malaysian university context. *Education and Information Technologies*, 29(9), 10611–10647. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-023-12221-6>
- Teng, D. C. E., Chen, N. S., Kinshuk, & Leo, T. (2012). Exploring students' learning experience in an international online research seminar in the Synchronous Cyber Classroom. *Computers and Education*, 58(3), 918–930. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2011.10.018>

- Tobin, T. J. (2018). The eLearning Leader's Toolkit for Evaluating Online Teaching. In *Leading and Managing e-Learning* (pp. 235–251). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-61780-0_17
- Tohirin, T., & Mardiana, D. (2025). The Role of Counselors and University Students' Adversity Quotient in Enhancing Islamic Education (PAI) Online Learning: Insights from the COVID-19 Experience. *Educational Process: International Journal*, 14(e2025030), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.22521/edupij.2025.14.30>
- Wajdi, F., Fauzia, S., & Hakam, A. (2020). Evaluasi Program Tahfidz Melalui Media Sosial di Yayasan Indonesia Berkah. *Jurnal Online Studi Al-Qur An*, 16(1), 69–88. <https://doi.org/10.21009/jsq.016.1.05>

Copyright holder:

© Amin, R., Bian, D. R., Hamid, N. F. F., Ismail, N. I., Salamah, N., Ahmad, S., Usman, A. H. (2026)

First publication right:

International Journal of Multidisciplinary of Higher Education (IJMURHICA)

This article is licensed under:

CC-BY-SA